Putting the Genie Back in the Bottle: The Science of Nuclear Non-Proliferation

Jerry Gilfoyle Physics Department, University of Richmond, Virginia

Outline: 1. Nuclear Weapons 101.

- 2. The Comprehensive Test Ban Treaty.
- 3. Loose Nukes.
- 4. Science and the Public Good.
- 5. Why should you care? and Conclusions.

Jerry Gilfoyle

Some Bits of History

• US develops and uses nuclear weapons on Japan at the end of World War II (1945). Other countries follow; current count is nine.

Some Bits of History

- US develops and uses nuclear weapons on Japan at the end of World War II (1945). Other countries follow; current count is nine.
- Cold War leads to nuclear arms race between US and its allies and the Soviet Union.

- US develops and uses nuclear weapons on Japan at the end of World War II (1945). Other countries follow; current count is nine.
- Cold War leads to nuclear arms race between US and its allies and the Soviet Union.
- Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty (NPT) enters into force (1970).
 - Prevent the spread of nuclear weapons, fissile materials, and technology.
 - Reduce or eliminate nuclear weapons.
 - Support the right to peacefully use nuclear technology

- US develops and uses nuclear weapons on Japan at the end of World War II (1945). Other countries follow; current count is nine.
- Cold War leads to nuclear arms race between US and its allies and the Soviet Union.
- Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty (NPT) enters into force (1970).
 - Prevent the spread of nuclear weapons, fissile materials, and technology.
 - Reduce or eliminate nuclear weapons.
 - Support the right to peacefully use nuclear technology
- Collapse of the Soviet Union
 - Many components of the Soviet nuclear arsenal left behind in the former Soviet Union (FSU).
 - Collapse of Russian ruble in 1998 leaves even Russian arsenal with limited funds for maintenance and security of nuclear materials.

- Fissile materials (²³⁵U, ²³⁹Pu) release enormous energies.
- As each nucleus splits, it emits 2 or so neutrons plus lots of energy (≈ 180 MeV).
- If density is high, a 'chain reaction' will cause other fissions in a self-propagating process.



 Only about 8 kg of plutonium or 25 kg of highly-enriched uranium (HEU) is needed is needed to produce a weapon.



Jerry Gilfoyle

- Energy released in the form of light, heat and blast.
- **9** Blast \approx 40-50% of total energy.
- Thermal radiation ≈30-50% of total energy.
- Ionizing radiation ≈5% of total energy.
- Residual radiation ≈5-10% of total energy.
- Figure shows effect of a 15 kiloton bomb (about the size of the Hiroshima bomb) exploded over the Gottwald Science Center.





- Energy released in the form of light, heat and blast.
- **9** Blast \approx 40-50% of total energy.
- Thermal radiation ≈30-50% of total energy.
- Ionizing radiation ≈5% of total energy.
- Residual radiation ≈5-10% of total energy.
- Figure shows effect of a 15 kiloton bomb (about the size of the Hiroshima bomb) exploded over the Gottwald Science Center.





The Comprehensive Test Ban Treaty (CTBT)

- The CTBT bans all nuclear explosions to limit the proliferation of nuclear weapons.
- A network of seismological, hydroacoustic, infrasound, and radionuclide sensors will monitor compliance.
- On-site inspection will be provided to check compliance.
- The US has signed the CTBT, but not ratified it.





Green - ratified Blue - signed Red - outside treaty

The CTBT Verification Regime

- The International Monitoring System (IMS), consists of 337 facilities that constantly monitor for signs of nuclear explosions. Over 70% are already collecting data.
- Detection technologies:
 - Seismic: 50 primary and 120 auxiliary seismic stations monitor shock waves.
 - Hydroacoustic: 11 hydrophone stations 'listen' for sound waves in the oceans.
 - Infrasound: 60 stations on the surface can detect ultra-low frequency sound waves (inaudible to the human ear) that are emitted by large explosions.
 - Radionuclide: 80 stations measure radioactive particles in the atmosphere, 40 also pick up noble gases.
- On-site-Inspection: If IMS data from the IMS show a nuclear test has ocurred, a Member State can request an on-site-inspection subject to a vote.





- North Korean tests a nuclear bomb on October 9, 2006.
 - More than 20 CTBTO seismic stations capture the blast.
 - Radionuclides detected two weeks and 4700 miles away (!) in the Yukon.
- They do it again on May 25, 2009
 - Sixty-one CTBTO seismic stations capture the blast.
 - No radionuclides are found!!?? \rightarrow Epic fail?



- The fun never ends; another test on February 12, 2013
 - CTBTO seismic stations capture the blast.
 - Radionuclides found again! Link

What is Happening?

- Geologists detect the shaking induced by the blast and pinpoint the site of the explosion within 100 meters first sign of a test. And then estimate the yield (**geology**).
- A few special nuclei made in the blast (xenon) are chemically inert and find their way through a kilometer of rock to reach the atmosphere.
- Calculations of the weather enables meteorologists to predict the spread of the plume from the blast (meteorology, physics, computer science).
- Air monitoring stations process huge amounts of air to capture the xenon atoms (**chemistry**).
- Nuclear physics detectors make the final identification of the decay of the xenon nuclei (nuclear physics).
- Now comes the response (political science).

What is Happening?

- Geologists detect the shaking induced by the blast and pinpoint the site of the explosion within 100 meters - first sign of a test. And then estir Detecting the nuclear test re-
- A fe quires sophisticated science that inert and draws on many people in many atm disciplines!
- Calculations of the neutrer enables meteorologists to predict the spread of the plume from the blast (meteorology, physics, computer science).
- Air monitoring stations process huge amounts of air to capture the xenon atoms (**chemistry**).
- Nuclear physics detectors make the final identification of the decay of the xenon nuclei (nuclear physics).
- Now comes the response (political science).

What is Happening?

- Geologists detect the shaking induced by the blast and pinpoint the site of the explosion within 100 meters - first sign of a test. And then estir Detecting the nuclear test re-
- A fe guires sophisticated science that ' inert draws on many people in many and atmo disciplines!
- Calc.... the spread of the plume from the blast (meteorology, physics,
- Air 🛛 re the
- ^{com} International response is driven ^{Air |} by the scientific results scien-^{xenc} tists have to get it right! decay of
- Nucl the xenon nuclei (nuclear physics).
- Now comes the response (**political science**).

- The President is committed to bringing the CTBT to a vote for ratification in the Senate.
- In clandestine nuclear tests could not be verified (by the IMS). ... even when Pyongyang declared that it would conduct a nuclear-weapons test and announced where and when it would occur, this monitoring system failed to collect necessary radioactive gases and particulates to prove that a test had occurred.

Senator Jon Kyl - R, Arizona: *Why We Need to Test Nuclear Weapons*, Wall Street Journal, October 20, 2009.

The worst-case scenario under a no-CTBT regime poses far bigger threats to U.S. security - sophisticated nuclear weapons in the hands of many more adversaries - than the worst-case scenario of clandestine testing in a CTBT regime, within the constraints posed by the monitoring system.

National Academy of Sciences (NAS), *Technical Issues Related to the Comprehensive Nuclear-Test-Ban Treaty*, Washington, D.C., National Academy Press, 2002, pp. 10.

"All the News That's Fit to Print" **Ehe New York Eimes**

Late Edition

New York: Today, cloudy with some light snow, high 35. Tonight, early snow, low 27. Tomorrow, becoming partly sunny, high 35. Yesterday, high 34, low 25. Weather map, Page D8.

VOL. CL . . No. 51,624

Copyright © 2001 The New York Times

NEW YORK, FRIDAY, JANUARY 5, 2001

\$1 beyond the greater New York metropolitan area

75 CENTS

REPORT TO CLINTON ASKS U.S. TO RATIFY TEST-BAN TREATY

A LAST-DITCH CAMPAIGN

Retired Head of Joint Chiefs Seeks to Assuage Critics of Pact Assailed by Bush

By MICHAEL R. GORDON

A former chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff who conducted a comprehensive study of the nuclear test ban treaty at the request of President Clinton has concluded that the United States must ratify it in order to mount an effective campaign against the spread of nuclear weapons.

The assessment by Gen. John M. Shalikashvil, who was chairman of the Joint Chiefs from 1993 to 1997, is part of a last-ditch attempt by Mr. Clinton to build support for the treaty, which Senate Republicans rejected in 1998 and on which Presidentelect George W. Bush's own top aides have sharply disagreed.

General Shallkahvill's report outlines measures intended to assuage critics of the treaty, including increased speeding on verification, greater efforts to maintain the United States nuclear arsenal and a joint review by the Senate and administration every 10 years to determine whether the treaty is still in American interests.

President-elect Bush assailed the treaty as unverifiable and unenforce-

Road Ban Set For One-Third Of U.S. Forests Clinton Order Will Put

Logging Off Limits

By DOUGLAS JEHL

WASHINGTON, Jan. 4 — In the biggest land conservation act in decades, President Clinton will approve an order on Friday putting nearly a third of the national forest land permanently off limits to road building and logging.

The move, covering more than 83 million acres in 39 states, is to be cast by the White House as a capstone in the president's efforts to protect public lands from broken on only commercial logging but also oil and gas development across am area larger than the nation's current national parks. And while not specifically banned, of rhead vehicle activiling in the roadless areas because of their inaccessibility.

The president's order, a strengthened version of an October 1999 administration proposal, is likely to set off furious challenges from Western states and Republican lawmakers who have called the plan hasty and irresponsible.

Among those who plan to head almost immediately to federal coart to try to block the sweeping effort is the governor of Idaho, who with other Westerners has denounced the action as an unwise intrusion into landuse decisions better made at a local level.

In the presidential campaign,

Three Who Are Losing Their Old Chairmanships ...



Bud Shuster of Pennsylvania Former chairman of the Transportation and Infrastructure Committee announced yesterday that he was resigning.



Former chairman of the Judiciary Committee, who led the impeachment of President Clinton; new chairman of International Relations.

... and Three New Chairmen of Powerful Committees



Bill Thomas of California Ways and Means



Susana

Billy Tauzin of Louislana Energy and Commerce



Jim Leach of lowa

Michael G. Oxley of Ohio

Einancial Sensices

Former chairman of Banking and Financial Services Committee; still in Congress but no longer a chairman.



FIGHT FOR COVETED POSTS

In the Evenly Divided Senate, Democrats Move Toward a Deal to Share Power

By LIZETTE ALVAREZ

WASHINGTON, Jan. 4 — Six years after promising to change the ways of Washington fundamentally, House Republicans today made good on their pledge to curtail the power of committee barons and replaced 13 of their most senior chairmen.

The newly created selection process created fierce competition among members who sough the positions, intensified party fund-raising by the members seeking to demonstrate loyalty and led to the creation of a new committee.

Representative Bill Thomas, a California known for his sharp intellect and temper, was named as the chairman of the Ways and Means Committee, which oversees tax polidefeating a more sector and more conservative competitor. And Representative Henry J. Hyde of Illinois, who as chairman of the Judicary Committee handled President Clinton's Impeachment, will now head tee.

In an institution where change usually comes slowly and against great



Late Edition

New York: Today, cloudy with some light snow, high 35. Tonight, early snow, low 27. Tomorrow, becoming partly sunny, high 35. Yesterday, high 34, low 25. Weather map, Page D8.

That's Fit to Print"

"All the News

Copyright © 2001 The New York Times

NEW YORK, FRIDAY, JANUARY 5, 2001

\$1 beyond the greater New York metropolitan area

75 CENTS

REPORT TO CLINTON ASKS U.S. TO RATIFY TEST-BAN TREATY

A LAST-DITCH CAMPAIGN

Retired Head of Joint Chiefs Seeks to Assuage Critics of Pact Assailed by Bush

By MICHAEL R. GORDON A former chairman of the soint Chien of Staff who conducted a compromise study of the nuclear test han (negregation of the source of the President Clinical Mass concluded that the United States must ratify it in order to mount an effective campaign against the spread of nuclear weapons.

The assessment by Gen. John M. Shalikashvil, who was chairman of the Joint Chiefs from 1993 to 1997, is part of a last-ditch attempt by Mr. Clinton to build support for the treaty, which Senate Republicans rejected in 1998 and on which Presidentelect George W. Bush's own top aides have sharply disagreed.

General Shallkahvill's report outlines measures intended to assuage critics of the treaty, including increased speeding on verification, greater efforts to maintain the United States nuclear arsenal and a joint review by the Senate and administration every 10 years to determine whether the treaty is still in American interests.

President-elect Bush assailed the treaty as unverifiable and unenforce-

Road Ban Set For One-Third Of U.S. Forests Clinton Order Will Put

Clinton Order Will Pi Logging Off Limits

By DOUGLAS JEHL

WASHINGTON, Jan. 4 — In the biggest land conservation act in decades, President Clinton will approve an order on Friday putting nearly a third of the national forest land permanently off limits to road building and logging.

The move, covering more than 83 million acres in 39 states, is to be cast by the White House as a capstone in the president's efforts to protect public lands from broken on only commercial logging but also oil and gas development across am area larger than the nation's current national parks. And while not specifically banned, of rhead vehicle activiling in the roadless areas because of their inaccessibility.

The president's order, a strengthened version of an October 1999 administration proposal, is likely to set off furious challenges from Western states and Republican lawmakers who have called the plan hasty and irresponsible.

Among those who plan to head almost immediately to federal coart to try to block the sweeping effort is the governor of Idaho, who with other Westerners has denounced the action as an unwise intrusion into landuse decisions better made at a local level.

In the presidential campaign,

Three Who Are Losing Their Old Chairmanships ...



Bud Shuster of Pennsylvania Former chairman of the Transportation and Infrastructure Committee announced yesterday that he was resigning.



Former chairman of the Judiciary Committee, who led the impeachment of President Clinton; new chairman of International Relations.

... and Three New Chairmen of Powerful Committees



Bill Thomas of California Ways and Means



Susana

Billy Tauzin of Louislana Energy and Commerce



Jim Leach of Jowa

Former chairman of Banking and

still in Congress but no longer a

Financial Services Committee

Michael G. Oxley of Ohio Financial Services

HONORING '95 VOW, HOUSE REPUBLICANS REPLACE 13 CHIEFS

FIGHT FOR COVETED POSTS

In the Evenly Divided Senate, Democrats Move Toward a Deal to Share Power

By LIZETTE ALVAREZ

WASHINGTON, Jan. 4 — Six years after promising to change the ways of Washington fundamentally, House Republicans today made good on their pledge to curtail the power of committee barons and replaced 13 of their most senior chairmen.

The newly created selection process created fierce competition among members who sough the positions, intensified party fund-raising by the members seeking to demonstrate loyalty and led to the creation of a new committee.

Representative Bill Thomas, a California Rhown for his sharp intellect and temper, was named as the chairman of the Ways and Means Committee, which oversees tax polidefeating a more senior and more conservative competitor. And Representative Henry J. Hyde of Illinois, who as chairman of the Judiciary Committee handled President Clintion Interpretation Relations Committee.

In an institution where change usually comes slowly and against great

The Soviet and US Nuclear Arsenals

- By the end of the Cold War the US and USSR had nuclear arsenals containing about 64,000 warheads on various delivery vehicles.
- US and Soviet military stockpiles contained about 1600 tons of highly-enriched uranium (HEU) and about 200 tons of plutonium.



• An unforeseen consequence of the end of the Cold War was the disposition of nuclear weapons materials.

Loose Nukes?

Fissile Material Security in Russia Declines

- The economic situation in Russia left few funds for maintaining the security of now-unused nuclear materials.
- Reports by the National Research Council in 1994, 1997 and 1999 have revealed the extent of the decline of security.



Building at the Kurchatov Institute housing enough HEU for a nuclear bomb. It had no motion sensors, detectors, or portal monitors.

- In the 1990's there have been numerous instances of smugglers apprehended with nuclear materials.
- In late 1998 the Russian FSB (successor to the KGB) reports stopping an attempt to steal 18.5 kg of weapons-usable material.

- The US and most other nations have a long-standing policy of nuclear nonproliferation.
- A nuclear blast would have horrific consequences; loss of life, property, and security.
- Even acquisition of a nuclear weapon by an adversary could have a devastating influence on US security and non-proliferation.
- One of the highest hurdles to obtaining a nuclear weapon is acquiring enough weapons-grade fissile material to produce a bomb. Iraq spent \$5-\$10 billion in the 1980's to produce a few grams of plutonium.
- Smuggling fissile material is a 'short-cut' to acquiring nuclear weapons; it lowers the acquisition hurdle.
- Prevention (*i.e.*, security) is critical especially against an 'insider' threat.

- What can a terrorist organization do?
 - Acquiring the necessary technology to enrich uranium or plutonium is beyond the capabilities of most terrorists.
 - Stealing the necessary fissile material is NOT!
 - A gun-type, uranium weapon of low yield is still a difficult endeavor, but could be done.
 - There are other alternatives for terrorists like a 'dirty bomb'.
 - The likeliest terrorist weapons are still guns and conventional explosives.
- All of the above can be negated if one of the current nuclear powers gives one away. This is unlikely.

The US Response?

• In 1991 the US Congress passes the Nunn-Lugar Act. The US pays to improve security of fissile materials and to dismantle the Russian nuclear complex (cooperative threat reduction).



Fissile Material Storage Facility under construction at Mayak, financed by the US Cooperative Threat Reduction program.

- The US spends about \$700 million a year to reduce this threat.
- The Fissile Material Storage Facility (FMSF) will securely store plutonium and uranium from dismantled weapons.
- The HEU Purchase Agreement requires 500 metric tons of HEU to be downblended to reactor fuel (a form not usable in a nuclear weapon) by 2013 at a cost of \$20 billion.







There exists a publicly unknown number of buildings containing weapon-usable nuclear material in Russia on which the United States and Russia have never agreed to cooperate.

Country	Year	
Iraq	1992	
Colombia	1996	
Spain	1997	
Denmark	1998	
Georgia	1998	
Philippines	1999	
Thailand	1999	
Slovenia	1999	
Brazil	1999	
Sweden	2002	
Greece	2005	
South Korea	2007	
Latvia	2008	
Bulgaria	2008	
Portugal	2008	
Romania	2009	
Libya	2009	
Taiwan	2009	
Turkey	2010	

Countries that have eliminated all weapons-usable fissile material.

Reproduced from M. Bunn, Securing the Bomb 2010, Harvard University and the Nuclear Threat

	\sim		
lerry/		tow	16
Jella	GII	1100	115

Number of Building Upgrades Completed During the Fiscal Year		Country	Year		
1996 5	1996 5	E Projections		Iraq Colombia	1992 1996
		% of 2017			
Action Taken	Completed	Goal	Action Taken	Completed	% of 2017 Goal
Warheads			SLBM Launchers		
Deactivated	7616	82.2%	Eliminated	492	80.4%
ICBMs Destroyed			Nuclear Air-to-Surface		
	914	87.8%	Missiles Destroyed	906	100%
ICBM Silos Eliminated	498	76.4%	Bombers Eliminated	155	100%
ICBM Mobile			Nuclear Test		
Launchers Destroyed	197	54.9%	Tunnels/Holes Sealed	194	100%
Nuclear Weapons-			Nuclear Weapons		
Carrying Submarines			Transport Train		
Destroyed	33	84.6%	Shipments	611	73.7%
Submarine-Launched			Nuclear Weapons		
Ballistic Missiles	10004400		Storage Facility	100	
(SLBMs) Destroyed	695	95.3%	Upgrades	24	100%
Cooperative Biological			Declared CW Agent		
Engagement	194		Destroyed (Metric		
Laboratories Secured	47	57.3%	Tons)	4018.6	73.4%

Reproduced from M. Bunn, Securing the Bomb 2010, Harvard University and the Nuclear Threat

Conclusions

- Do we live in a safer world than during the Cold War? Yes, sort of.
 - The threat of nuclear Armageddon has receded with the lowering of tensions between Russia and the US.
- Has the threat of a nuclear conflict increased? Yes, sort of.
 - While the threat of a large-scale nuclear war between Russia and the US is smaller, the proliferation of nuclear weapons technology has increased the risk of nuclear weapons being used.
- What can be done? Lots, but it will take time, money (Opps! There goes my tax cut!) and leadership from the US (CTBT, NPT, ABM, BWC, CTR).
- What can I do?
 - Learn! Cut through the hype.
 - Vote! Write to Congress.
 - The US and other countries are in desperate need of technical expertise.



• Over the last 100 years at least 50% of the growth in our standard of living is due to technological change.

- Over the last 100 years at least 50% of the growth in our standard of living is due to technological change.
- It's expensive!

JLab, where I do my research, cost about \$500 million in 1994 (about 1/4 - 1/2 a Space Shuttle mission).



- Over the last 100 years at least 50% of the growth in our standard of living is due to technological change.
- It's expensive!

JLab, where I do my research, cost about \$500 million in 1994 (about 1/4 - 1/2 a Space Shuttle mission).

 Technological spinoffs: NMR→MRI, WWW, transistors, computers, ... At JLab about 100 devices have been patented.



- Over the last 100 years at least 50% of the growth in our standard of living is due to technological change.
- It's expensive!

JLab, where I do my research, cost about \$500 million in 1994 (about 1/4 - 1/2 a Space Shuttle mission).

- Technological spinoffs: NMR→MRI, WWW, transistors, computers, ... At JLab about 100 devices have been patented.
- Production of trained scientists, engineers, technicians. all from basic science research.

About 200 doctoral theses have come out of JLab.



In Paris in 1783 Benjamin Franklin watched with amazement one of the first hot-air balloon flights. The following exchange was said to occur. Questioner to Franklin: Sir, what's the use of flying in the air?

JLab, where I do my research, cost about \$500 million in 1994 (about 1/4 - 1/2 a Space S

- Technological spinot WWW, transistors, c At JLab about 100 patented.
- Production of traine neers, technicians.
 science research.
 About 200 doctoral out of JLab.





In Paris in 1783 Benjamin Franklin watched with amazement one of the first hot-air balloon flights. The following exchange was said to occur.

Questioner to Franklin: Sir, what's the use of flying in the air? Ben Franklin's answer: Sir, what's the use of a newborn baby?

JLab, where I do my research, cost about \$500 million in 1994 (about 1/4 - 1/2 a Space S

- Technological spinot WWW, transistors, c At JLab about 100 patented.
- Production of traine neers, technicians.
 science research.
 About 200 doctoral out of JLab.





Jerry Gilfoyle

nklin watched with amazement one of the ne following exchange was said to occur.

what's the use of flying in the air? what's the use of a newborn baby?

ch, cost about \$500 million in 1994 (about





out of JLab.

Jerry Gilfoyle

Science Policy

Additional Slides

- Vulnerability of fissile material to insider theft.
 - The USSR relied on 'guards, guns, and gulag' for security. Morale in the defense complex was high and there was less concern about smuggling by the staff.
 - Financial and economic problems in the Russian nuclear cities during the 1990's made the staff susceptible to the temptation of nuclear smuggling.
- Are there buyers?
 - Maybe!
 - Iraq spent \$5-\$10 billion in the 1980's to produce a few grams of plutonium. They continue this effort.
 - Iran has been acquiring nuclear technology (some from the Russians) for many years.
 - Aum Shinrikyo and Osama bin Laden's group (two terrorist organizations) supposedly tried to obtain fissile material.

If you want to get paid (jobs):

- The National Academies (NAS, NAE, NRC, IOM) hire Senior Project Assistants and Research Assistants.
- The scientific societies (AIP, APS, AGU, AGI, ACS, AAAS or AAS) hire science policy researchers.
- Other organizations like the Center for Science, Policy, and Outcomes, the Federation of American Scientists, and the Union of Concerned Scientists sometimes hire researchers.
- The General Accounting Office hires researchers.
- The Congressional Research Service (CRS) produces an annual guide of policy jobs in Washington, DC.

- Policy-makers are in dire need of technical expertise in writing laws to evaluate national security threats, handle privacy, and regulate medical diagnostic testing.
- People are hungry for information.
- An educated electorate is essential.
- Training the populace could save lives in the event of an attack.
 - Panic will amplify the effect of an attack.
 - Panic is greatly diminished when people receive training.

What should you stay awake worrying about at night?

Deaths	Cause	Deaths	Cause
in 2002*		in 2000	
2,443,387	All causes	17,638	Homicide
918,628	Heart Disease	17,550	Poisoning
46,380	Vehicle Accidents	16,257	Falling
65,681	Influenza/Pneumonia	3,447	Drowning
31,655	Suicide	3,159	Fire

* National Vital Statistics Reports, 53, no. 5, October 12, 2004.